Convention and Innovation:
Wintry Landscapes in Pastoral Elegy¹)

Kazuyoshi Oishi*¹)

「コンベンションと革新～牧歌風挽歌における冬の風景」

大 石 和 欣

要 旨

無垢や幸福への憧憬あるいは黄金時代の象徴としての牧歌にも死は存在する。死が牧歌
の世界に足を踏み入れた途端、そこには哀歌が生まれ、また同時に風景も凍る。自然の恵
み豊かな楽園としての春や夏が消逝し、荒涼とした冬の枯野が忽然と現出す。古代ギリ
シャ時代より牧歌挽歌は詠まれ、枯野はひとつつのコンベンション（convention）として
確立されてきた。しかし、冬の枯野は意味が固定された表面的なイメージではなく、時代
によって意味を変化させ発展させてきたものなのだ。コンベンションは革新でもあったの
である。それは日本のような詩歌においても同様であろう。万葉の時代から花誮や子規まで冬の
枯野は季語として認識され、常に新しい意味を付与されてきた。本稿は西洋、特に英文学
における牧歌挽歌の中での冬の枯野という伝統的なイメージがどのように描かれている
かを代表作品をとりあげながら考察する。枯野にはもちろん政治的、歴史的言及が隠され
ていることが多いが、本稿では紙数の都合上議論を文学的なコンテクストに限定して慣習
的なイメージを詩人たちがどう扱い、どう詩的に革新していったかを、ルネッサンス、18
世紀、ロマン主義時代、20世紀の代表的作品を吟味しながら文学史的に追って考えてみると
ことになる。参考として時折日本の代表的詩歌の中の季語としての枯野をとりあげるが、
あくまで西洋・英文学の牧歌挽歌の特徴を明確化する手助けとしてある。本稿は2000
年ロンドンで開催された「世界俳句学会2000」での招聘講演を基に書き改めたものであ
る。

ABSTRACT

Pastoral poetry is often treated as an escapist, utopian vision of innocence and
happiness, but the bucolic felicity never lasts eternally. It is threatened, disturbed and
often ruined by the sudden invasion of Death, who freezes the utopian landscape into a
desolate wilderness. This is the moment of generic convergence in which the two separate
genres of pastoral and elegy merge into one, expressing grief over loss through figuratively

¹) 放送大学助教授（人間の探究）
dreary scenery. Since the Greek and Roman periods, pastoral elegy has been conventionally using wintry desolation as a symbolic locale of mortality and lamentation. This conventional framework of elegiac ideas and assumptions, however, has not inhibited the multiplication of their meanings in different ages and in different countries. The purpose of this essay is to provide a fresh viewpoint on the conventionalised image of wintry desolation in English pastoral elegy by briefly reviewing a similar convention in Japanese poetry for comparison. Wintry landscapes can certainly be examined as an ‘anti-pastoral’ or ‘counter-pastoral’ with heavy political and social implications, but due to the limited space in this paper, I would like to concentrate on the aesthetic dilemma between convention and innovation as we can find in the continuities and variations of wintry desolation in some exemplary English pastoral elegies.

Erwin Panofky once explored the historical process in which the Latin phrase ‘Et in Arcadia Ego’ underwent a series of iconographic deconstructions in European paintings. Whether the phrase is interpreted correctly as ‘Even in Arcadia, there am I’ or rather misleadingly as ‘memento mori’ or inaccurately as ‘I too was born, or lived, in Arcady’, the shadow of Death has been continuously haunting Western pastoral paintings with a power to disenchant the peace and happiness of idyllic visions instantly. His invisible, yet palpable existence is an established form of convention in the genre of pastoral landscape, but this does not inhibit the multiplication of its meanings in different ages and in different countries. The convention enjoys continuities and variations in the history of art.

The same observation can be made about the presence of Death in the history of literature. His gloomy spectre overshadows pastoral elegy, one of the most traditional literary genres in Western literature. Pastoral poetry is often treated by scholars as an escapist vision of innocence and happiness, but its bucolic felicity never remains immutable: it is threatened, disturbed and often ruined by the sudden invasion of Death, who freezes the blissful landscape into a desolate wilderness, a ‘Cold Pastoral’ as Keats put it, by a single blow of his deathly scythe. This is the moment of generic convergence in which the two separate genres of pastoral and elegy begins to merge into one, expressing grief over loss through forlorn scenery. Since the Greek and Roman periods, pastoral elegy has been invariably set in the wintry season, when all sentient beings are subject to death in the seasonal cycle of nature. And yet this convention has never prevented the image of wintry desolation from being modified, revised and developed according to individual circumstances and unique historical contexts. Samuel Johnson’s bigoted revulsion to Milton’s ‘Lycidas’ as a superficial clichéd pastoral elegy cannot always be justified. The conventional framework of elegy can sometimes be filled with an acute consciousness of human mortality and even with historical and political allusions.

The purpose of this essay is to provide a fresh viewpoint on the convention on seasonal words and images in English pastoral elegy by briefly reviewing a similar convention in Japanese poetry for comparison. A thorough generic study of English pastoral elegy is already presented by Peter M. Sacks, but his emphasis on the elegiac aspect of the literary
tradition tends to neglect the seasonal settings produced out of the conflict between tradition and innovation. For interest and importance, I would like to focus on the image of wintry, desolate landscape, as conventionalised in pastoral elegy, in contrast with the equivalent wintry *kigo* developed in Japanese poetry. I have chosen, in particular, the seasonal image of winter since similarities and differences between the two cultures are most profound and fascinating in poetic perceptions of a wintry scene. This comparison will serve to illustrate the different religious and philosophical backgrounds that underlay the convention of seasonal images in two different genres of poetry. By tracing the development of the literary tradition of pastoral elegy through some exemplary works, I shall examine how poets of different ages revised and refashioned the image of wintry landscape according to their new, modern contexts. Just as pastoral is fundamentally a locale of history and politics, the wintry desolation can certainly be examined as an ‘anti-pastoral’ or ‘counter-pastoral’ which heavily involves political and social implications. Yet the limited space in this paper will not allow me to discuss further such political meanings in the image of wintry desolation. Instead, I would like to rest my argument mainly on the aesthetic dilemma between convention and innovation as seen in some exemplary pastoral elegies in the West. The established literary tradition has always been a challenge for poets, who, whether inventive or not, have to struggle against the ‘anxiety of influence’ or the ‘burden of the past’. Japanese poets have been recreating the *kigo* convention for many centuries with constant employments of new meanings and images, and *haiku* with various *kigo* words enjoys an increasing popularity and globalisation today. By delving into the convention of the seasonal image of winter in a more traditional form of Western, especially English literature, I am hoping to propose a new approach to the poetics as it appears in the wintry landscape in pastoral elegy.

**The *Kigo* Convention and its Poetics**

Tamekane Kyogoku’s well-known essay on Japanese *waka* poetry in the late thirteenth century encapsulates the general idea of seasonal feelings and aesthetic images in traditional Japanese poetry. All poetic inspirations, he argues, should rise primarily and impromptu from a clear perception of correspondence between man’s inner heart and the surrounding natural phenomena. *So-ou* (相応＝‘correspondence’) is the word which Tamekane applies to this aesthetic dynamics. He then suggests that the best way to attain such spiritual conformity with the natural world is to observe and appreciate the beauty of each seasonal object, because the laws of nature reveal its most exquisite beauty and truth in the natural landscape that changes from season to season. For Japanese poets, the poetic representation of seasonal sentiment is an act of both aesthetic and spiritual importance through which their inner nature is both reconciled and harmonised with the movement of the whole universe.
Tamekane is here simply explaining the rationale behind the principle of *kigo* or seasonal word, which Japanese poets had been employing for a long time without being instructed. Even in the *Man-yo-shu* or *The Collection of Ten Thousand Leaves* (c.771–78), seasonal words are already conventionalised with a considerable number of poems arranged under the headings of each season from spring to winter. In *haiku* poems, conventionalised *kigos* represent a sophistication of Japanese seasonal sensibilities and poetics. While holding a rather flexible view on the use of *kigo*, Basho observes in *The Records of a Travel-Worn Satchel* (1688) that all that excel in art ‘possess one thing in common, that is, a mind to obey nature, to be one with nature, throughout the four seasons of the year’. The unity between art and nature is emphasised here again.

*Kigo* is by no means a unique feature of Japanese poetical tradition alone. The correspondence between man’s inner nature and the external nature is also a concept of historic significance in the West. Renaissance poets felt their inner world being controlled by the ‘touches of sweet harmony’ in heavenly spheres, as Lorenzo articulates in Shakespeare’s *The Merchant of Venice*. William Wordsworth was also enlivened by a ‘corresponding mild creative breeze’. His ‘wise passiveness’ to the edifying influence of nature is infinitely close to Basho’s obedience to nature. The vast, eternal omnipresence of ‘Nature’ is the vital source for both human life and poetic inspiration in Western literature.

It is not surprising then to discover the various seasonal images being equally conventionalised in Western literature. Pastoral elegy supplies a good example in which seasonal images are traditionally employed to symbolise a certain state of mind or to evoke a specific mood. Poets have recurrently adopted this poetic form since the Greek and Roman periods as a means to lament the death of a beloved one within an allegorical framework. The age of innocent happiness and vigorous youth is being represented in the green pasture of spring and summer, which is then followed by the dark wintry desolation laden with the grief of death. In winter, both the animate and the inanimate mourn for death. Man and nature are united in sorrow and distress. John Milton expressed his sense of loss in a wintry landscape when his friend Edward King was drowned in 1637:

```
The willows, and the hazel copses green
    Shall no more be seen
    Fanning their joyous leaves to thy soft lays.
```

It is this clichéd image of wintry desolation that W. H. Auden recreates in his modern pastoral elegy for W. B. Yeats, who died in January 1939:

```
He disappeared in the dead of winter:
The brooks were frozen, the air-ports almost deserted,
```
And snow disfigured the public statues;  
The mercury sank in the mouth of the dying day.  

A Japanese version of this wintry image is probably ‘the withered moor’, which also serves as a locale of death. The image of desolate wintry wilderness has been used and reproduced by Japanese poets under the mixed religious influence of Polytheism, Shintoism, Confucianism, Taoism and Buddhism, which have gradually intermingled with each other and continued to dominate the spiritual life of Japan. A well-known poem by Muneyuki Minamoto in the *Kokin-waka-shu* or *The Collection from Ancient and Modern Times* (905) illustrates the Japanese aesthetic consciousness of transience, which grew increasingly common as the Buddhist worldview of inconstancy prevailed in the medieval period. The desolation of nature becomes distinctively associated with the sense of human mortality or with the awareness of the mutability of earthly existence:

Far more deserted and forlorn stands a hamlet on the wintry mountains;  
Not a human form moves on the dry, faded leaves of grass.

It is difficult to express in English the exquisite nuances created by the pun in the original Japanese ‘かれぬ’, which means ‘desertion’ and ‘withering’ at once and thus most vividly represents the picture of the deserted wintry moor in the reader’s mind.

More dramatic and typical is the desolate moor in Basho’s famous ‘death poem’, composed truly on his deathbed:

Here ends my journey, upon this deathbed;  
And yet I rove, and still rove  
Thro’ the wild, desolate moor—a wandering dream.

Basho’s use of the image is most original and distinctive in representing the forlorn, wintry moor symbolically as his own inner landscape where he himself becomes a visionary spirit roaming and seeking for the ultimate truth in nature and universe. The tangible reality of the moor is lost in the poem. Nor is it simply an internalised wilderness as in Auden’s elegy: it is stripped of local or temporal particularities and becomes a dramatic vision of Basho’s own naked identity. On his deathbed, he yearned after his wandering life in the past, where he harmonised his inner self with the law of nature. He reached the enlightened Zen world of ‘Nothingness’ through this spiritual communion. He there discovered the link between now and eternity, between this world and the world to come, and between self and beyond. While waiting for his last moment, his imagination returned to this vast space of ‘Nothingness’. It is a vision in which all he saw and all he wrote
vanished away like dreams, and in which he himself turned into a wandering dream. The whole universe is a blank and colourless void, where the boundaries between life and death dissolves, and he continues to rove, dream, and yearn for happy spring, summer and autumnal beauties, only to find them all mere illusions. This view of life and death is linked with the so-called *wabi* aesthetics, which aspires after a state of absolute purity by discarding all superficial appearances of the natural world. Basho’s desolate moor represents this Japanese aesthetics, evoking the ghostly shadow of the whole earthly life in an eternalised vision during the last moment of his life. Instead of pitying himself, his last self-elegy sublimated and redeemed his poetic soul into the sphere of ‘Nothingness’ and thereby let it stand as an epitaph for his wandering *haiku* life.

The withered moor or field emerges as a conventional wintry *kigo* both in Japanese poetry and in Western pastoral elegy, evoking the feeling of sorrow and the pathos of melancholy. It functions as a locale of death and mourning, embodying the sympathetic communion between the human heart and the natural world, or the correspondence between human nature and the law of the universe. But their seeming similarities belie the historical and ideological divergences operating behind the lines with radically different implications. We need to make some more careful examinations of wintry landscapes in exemplary Western pastoral elegies in order to trace the way in which poets in the West repeatedly challenged and reconstructed the convention of the seasonal image. Just like the cyclic progress of all seasons, the *kigo* image recurs, but never stays identical.

**The Wintry Landscape of Desolation in Western Pastoral Elegies**

In classical pastoral elegy, humanity and nature are believed to maintain a degree of seasonal harmony. Book 1 of Theocritus’s *Idylls* sets up a prototype in which the whole nature is unified with humanity in lamentation. Wolves, jackals and lions all mourn for the fate of Daphnis, and nature already feels for his absence from this world: ‘No more to your woods, to your groves and thickets no more, fares the neatherd Daphnis’. In Bion’s ‘Lament for Adonis’, sorrow is tinged with a desolate autumnal colour; the ‘flowers turn brown for grief’, whilst rivers and springs weep for dead Adonis with the Goddess Aphrodite. Winter arrives more distinctively in Virgil’s bucolic world with the death of Daphnis, in whom the oriental myth of Adonis as a vegetation god is assimilated:

Daphnis graced all nature—when he died,  
Corn-god and Song-god left us too.

The wintry landscape or image of desolation functions as a metaphor for human mortality, and therefore as a requiem. Daphnis as a vegetation god adds a new structure and dimension to pastoral elegy; for he is deified as a guardian star, just as the return of spring
restores faded flowers to their full colour and bloom again. Nevertheless, the shadow of the returning season of death still haunts Virgil’s pastoral world, with the war going on around him.

The image of nature in grief is so-called ‘pathetic fallacy’, a poetic convention whereby non-emotional natural objects are being described as if they could feel human sorrow. The term was initially coined by the Victorian critic John Ruskin to disparage his contemporaries’ abuse of such metaphorical expression. Literary conventions lose their fresh appeal when they become mere outworn ornaments. Nevertheless, it is noteworthy that ‘pathetic fallacy’ was a vital rhetoric in the classical eras, when people lived in harmony with the natural world. The weeping nature represents the correspondence between human pathos and the natural world which classical poets maintained within their world.

A similar kind of ‘pathetic fallacy’ can be seen in classical Japanese poetry. Just like the ancient Greeks, Japanese people in the Manyo period are considered as having lived peacefully with thousands of gods and myths born out of every article of nature. Their guileless perceptions readily arrested a pathos and tactile picture of the surrounding landscape. The following poem composed by Kakinomoto Hitomaro employs an image of the withered field with a strong polytheistic resonance:

Here am I again on this wild, overgrown field,
where people are mowing and weeding;
A memento of the prince, who vanished, like autumnal leaves.

The poem was written on the occasion when Prince Karu went to the bushy field of Aki to recollect the image of his dead father Prince Kusakabe, who used to spend many nights walking around and sleeping on the field, far from the sumptuous palace. Prince Kusakabe is perceived as a kind of genius loci of the field: like Daphnis and Adonis in Greek and Latin poems, he wandered freely as the guardian god of the field and was integrated within the natural world. When he was gone, the field and trees mourned dismally for his disappearance. ‘The golden or fading leaves of autumn’ is a pre-fix phrase for the word ‘passing away’, but its image and implications further add the sense of transience and loss to the bleakness of the wild field.

Both in classical Western pastoral elegies and in Japanese poetry, seasonal metaphors humanise the natural world and, vice versa, naturalise human sentiments and life. The vigour and happiness of their lives are being assured and further heightened by the ever-blooming flowers of the green pastures, but they are soon to be replaced by a wintry bleakness, annually reminding them of inescapable human mortality and calling forth mourning songs.
Winter in Renaissance Pastoral Elegies

After a process of Christian allegorisation during the medieval period, pastoral elegy re-emerged as a popular genre in the West during the Renaissance period. Boccacio and Petrarch rediscovered the form in Italy, whilst Ronsard and Marot recreated its tradition in France. In England, Philip Sidney reworked on it in The Arcadia (1581, 1583-4), whilst Spenser wrote Astrophel (1586) for Sidney and Daphnaïda (1591) for Sir Arthur Gorges's wife. They all assimilated Christian ethics into classical literary conventions.

Milton's 'Lycidas' is often taken to be representative of all modern pastoral elegies in English, but it would be more appropriate to discuss Edmund Spenser as the first of note that attempted to incorporate the Classical literary legacy into English language. He did not naively accept the conventional rhetoric and images from his predecessors in Europe. His 'November' eclogue in The Shepherdes Calender (1579) refashioned the conventionalised image of wintry scenery in a new context in the most significant manner. While synthesising the classical conventions with the Chaucerian native strain, Spenser incorporated the classical topos into the compound of elegy and lover's complaint, both the favourite genres of Renaissance poets. He was too aware of the artificial rhetoric of pastoral elegy to use the clichéd seasonal image uncritically. From March to February, the eclogues develop philosophical arguments on love and life according to the suitable mood of each month of the year, and November is allocated for an elegiac mood. Spenser installed a new model for pastoral elegy by deliberately setting a cold, desolate month in Britain for a specific locale of pastoral elegy.

The 'November' elegy is sung by the shepherd-poet Colin Clout, who mourns for deceased Dido, as in Classical pastoral elegies, but his woeful tune rises from his own misery and anguish over an unrequited love. His melancholia, a common syndrome among infatuated Renaissance men, prohibits him from singing Theocritus's 'sweet' tune any longer. Here emerges a modern self-conscious poet whose distress is further deepened by the gloominess of the sad, despondent season. Dennis Kay argues that 'Spenser created in Colin Clout a poet in whose writing praise and ingenuity were inseparable, where ornament was integral to meaning, innovation and inspiration to sense'. What is more significant about Colin Clout, however, is the ambiguity of his poetical identity. He is presented in part as a professional poet who composes an elegy with impartial expertise, like Thyrsis in Theocritus's poem and Menalcas in Virgil's, but his love-wound is too painful to fit in harmoniously with the rigidly established motif of pastoral elegy. Clout as a distraught elegist is a Stoic rather than an Epicurean as in the case of shepherds in Greek and Roman pastorals. His self-conscious presence puts into question the prevailing view of the poem as a naïve pastoral elegy made of nothing more than the conventional, therefore artificial ornaments borrowed from the stale, outmoded texts.
Spenser’s poetic ingenuity appears most clearly in his application of this self-consciously elegiac mood to the wintry landscape. Colin Clout refuses to sing songs of mirth any more, not only because he is heart-broken, but also because such merry songs would not suit the gloominess of the season: ‘Thilke sollein season sadder plight doth aske: / And loatheth sike delightes, as thou doest praye’ (17–8). The vital dynamics operating in pastoral elegy is hinted at here. The sense of loss, or the strong awareness of mortality, is the essence of an elegy. At the same time, the sorrowful mood of the wintry season requires a far more melancholic mood than usual. Colin Clout implies that it is not just Death that demands an elegy: it is winter that compels the poet to mourn for the deceased. Here is an important twist of logic. Greek and Roman poets described a sudden desolation of natural beauty as an effect of death. In Spenser’s poem, it is the real presence of the dark, deathly season in Britain that makes Colin Clout invoke Melpomene, the Muse of tragedy, to mourn for Dido. And the grief is intensified reciprocally by the desolate English landscape.

The sonne of all the world is dimme and darke:
The earth now lacks her wonted light,
And all we dwell in deadly night,
O heauie herse.
Breake we our pypes, that shrild as lowde as Larke,
O carefull verse. (67–72)

Spenser further contrasts human life with the permanence of the ever-revolving seasonal cycles. It seems as though consolation and relief were being totally denied. He emphasises the eternal disappearance of Dido’s virtues and beauties from the earth. Whereas the withered flowers recover their vigour and beauty in every spring, human beings, once dead, would never come to life again. The wintry scene makes Colin Clout reflect most keenly upon the mortality of all human creatures. Flowers on the earth fade and die in winter, but they display their vigour and beauty when spring comes around every year. Human beings, by contrast, would never revive on earth, once dead. The virtues and beauties of Dido have eternally vanished from the earth. Echoes of the Bible and conventional pastoral elegies are mixed up in the following passage, which represents the mutability of human life in contrast to the endless cycle of death and rebirth in the natural world.

Whence is it, that the flouret of the field doth fade,
And lyeth buryed long in Winters bale:
Yet soone as spring his mantle doth displaye,
It floureth fresh, as it should neuer fayle?
But thing on earth that is of most availe,
As vertues braunch and beauties budde,
Reliuen not for any good.
O heauie herse,
The braunch once dead, the budde eke needes must quaile,
O carefull verse. (83—92)

The use of the *ubi sunt* motif with a seasonal image is a common biblical and classical *topos* as we see in the Bible (Job 14: 7—10), Moschus’s *Idylls* (3: 99—104), and Marot’s *Eglogue sur le Trépas* (178—81). And yet, Spenser renovates the tradition by shifting his focus from the death of a person to the disappearance of human beauties and virtues from the world. Dido’s death accordingly becomes an emblem of earthly transience. The elegy for her is a means to express the uneasy personal recognition of mutability. Spenser tried in vain to reconcile mutability on the earth with the immortality of the universe in the fragmentary *Mutabilitie Cantos* in *The Fairie Queene*: the invariable, permanent law of the universe in the repeating cycles of natural phenomenon remains incomplete and unestablished in this voluminous allegory.

The ‘November’ elegy likewise ends up fragmentarily with pessimism. Colin Clout cannot find a consolation or a substitution for his lost love even after Dido’s deification: his own distress continues to isolate him from the pastoral community. Instead of returning to the green pasture like Virgil’s shepherds, he remains alienated from the happy pastoral world. The pathos of sorrow turns into self-contempt and misanthropy, as such is characteristic of Renaissance melancholia. Perhaps Clout’s unconsolled isolation implies the uneasiness and anxiety of the narrator himself. The image of wintry desolation is innovated by Spenser into a metaphor for the morbid sensibility of a modern self-conscious individual.

The problems of literary inheritance and ambition occupy a central place in John Milton’s *Lycidas* (1637), an elegy for his friend Edward King, who was drowned on the Irish Seas in 1637. Born in 1608, Milton could not entirely escape from the persistent Renaissance dilemma caused by the heavy burden of tradition and the pressure of modern sensitivity. He made a clear and open use of the conventional, impersonal form of pastoral elegy in order to articulate his own individual grief over his friend’s premature death. A compromise is made in this poem between the rhetorical convention and the individual emotional pressure without resolving their palpable tensions entirely. In his acerbic criticism of *Lycidas*, Samuel Johnson saw nothing but hackneyed and superficial rhetoric: ‘In this poem there is no nature, for there is no truth, there is no art, for there is nothing new’. The poem, however, is by no means made of old, clichéd phrases alone: it contains religious and moral messages to the contemporary people. According to one critic, it can be seen as an ‘angry challenge... to the tradition it inherits’. The point is how the poet reconciled the convention with his individual impulses.
The general framework of the poem is built solidly on classical models of pastoral elegy in terms of structure and rhetoric and therefore provides a fine example for later English elegists to follow. From the very beginning of the poem, he stresses his keen awareness of the accumulated tradition of pastoral elegy and asks a pardon of the audience for his bold attempt to re-use the form for his elegy: ‘Yet once more, O ye laurels, and once more, / Ye myrtles brown, with ivy never sere’ (1–2). He then resorts to the established procedure of bringing the dead in the pastoral field and expressing grief and consolation in the images of changing seasons. The desolate wintry scenery is metaphorically adapted to represent the state of woeful deprivation.

Nevertheless, Milton could not remain subservient to the generic conventions of pastoral elegy. He defied the regulating power of the tradition by refusing to accept the metaphorical use of the desolate land as the authorised cliché:

But O the heavy change, now thou are gone,
Now thou art gone, and never must return!
Thee, Shepherd, thee the woods and desert caves,
With wild thyme and the gadding vine o’ergrown,
And all their echoes mourn.
The willows and the hazel copses green
Shall now no more be seen
Fanning their joyous leaves to thy soft lays.
As killing as the canker to the rose,
Or taint-worm to the weanling herds that graze,
Or frost to flowers, that their gay wardrobe wear,
When first the white-thorn blows;
Such, Lycidas, thy loss to shepherd’s ear. (37–49)

Just like his predecessors, Milton presents Edward King’s death as causing the sudden decay of nature. The fresh green of willows fades and falls, and sheer silence dominates the deserted, inanimate land. In the last five lines, Milton teases his readers by exposing the wintry desolation plainly as a figurative illusion. Instead of stating that Lycidas’s death has devastated nature, Milton deliberately reverses the order of the sentence and places ‘As killing as’ at the beginning, so that the readers’ imagination is halted in the midst between reality and illusion. At the last sentence, the word ‘Such’ reminds them that the wintry landscape is simply figurative.

The conventional image of desolate landscape was also developed in medieval Japanese poetry with a similarly acute sense of human mortality or of the mutability of all earthly beings. But it is firmly and distinctively based on the Buddhist worldview of inconstancy, which formulated a unique poetics different from the Western one. Scenic desolation is
more often located in autumn than in winter by Japanese poets, who appreciated beautiful natural objects in their fading moment. Autumnal desolation suits far better their aesthetic taste which inclines towards an indulgent lamentation for transient beauties or towards the so-called *yugen*, that is, nostalgic, yet ghostly imagery of the beauties that have eternally vanished. The well-known ‘Three Evening Poems’ in the *New Collection from Ancient and Modern Times* (1205) exemplify such a type of aesthetic consciousness during this period. Teika’s poem will be of most interest in exploring their poetics.

For flowers in bloom and red maple leaves, I look around in vain;
Only a hut on the dark, deserted seashore in the autumnal evening.

The poem is an elegy in the sense that they express the feelings of melancholy and loneliness rising from deep reflections on life and death. The darkening autumnal landscape makes the poet keenly aware of the evanescence of all earthly lives, which rise and fade away like dreams with the passing of seasons. Just as the sense of loss is intensified by the *ubi sunt* motif in Western poems, Teika achieves a similar effect by presenting a striking vision of spring flowers and autumn leaves as entirely missing on the bleak seashore. His *yugen* imagination captures the ephemeral beauties of ever-changing nature in a poetic vision. The influence of the Buddhist belief that nothing remains constant in the whole universe is explicit here. Though bemoaning the fleeting beauty, the poet, at the bottom of his heart, accepts the mutability of all sentient beings: they never resist the natural course of seasonal cycles.\(^{39}\)

**The Convention Naturalised and Romanticised**

It is true that the eighteenth century is often called the age of Neo-Classicism, in which people tended to seek models in classical texts and Augustan conventions, including pastorals and pastoral elegies.\(^{40}\) Alexander Pope eagerly upheld the Virgilian mode of simple, innocent and elegant pastoral.\(^{41}\) ‘Winter’ in his *Pastorals* (1709) is, indeed, an appropriate example of pastoral elegy in the early eighteenth century with a Virgilian dirge sung in a conventional form. Thyrsis describes how nature and animals cease to enjoy the beauties of nature after the death of Daphne: ‘Ah what avail the beauties nature wore? / Fair Daphne’s dead, and beauty is no more!’ (35–6).\(^{42}\)

As the concept of nature underwent a significant modification and revision in the century, however, the world of pastoral and pastoral elegy also began to change. Johnson’s unfair criticism of *Lycidas*, in fact, articulates a new view on the established genre of pastoral elegy in the mid-eighteenth century. Instead of adapting classical texts or representing utopian visions, pastoral elegy emerged with a more realistic resonance. Pastoral went out of the artificial domain of bucolic peace into the real nature, and with this movement, the
wintry landscape underwent a radical transformation in the genre of elegy. James Thomson’s ‘Winter’ (1726), the last book of his serial poem *The Seasons* (1726–30), represents the transformation of the poetics of wintry desolation, adapting classical images to a modern perception. Winter is ‘Sullen and sad’ (2), because ‘The soul of man dies in him, loathing life, / And black with more than melancholy views’ (61–2). The barren deserts covered with white snow obliterate flowers in spring, happy scenes in summer and crops and fruits in autumn. And their desolate blankness prompts our imagination to envisage what we saw, enjoyed, and dreamed in the past seasons, until we are brought to recognise that all these happy scenes are gone.

Ah! whither now are fled
Those dreams of greatness? Those unsolid hopes
Of happiness? those longings after fame?
Those restless cares? those busy bustling days?
Those gay-spent festive nights? those veering thoughts,
Lost between good and ill, that shared thy life?
All now are vanished! (1033–39)

The senses of mortality and mutability are brought home to us by the barren landscape. Winter became a locale of meditation on human life and death, and prompted flights of poetic imagination. Hence an internalisation of the desolate scenery. William Cowper shows how the wintry evening induces his ‘fancy, ludicrous and wild’ into ‘a waking dream of houses, tow’rs, / Trees, churches, and strange visages’ (*The Task*, 4: 286–88). And the music of village bells in winter leads his spirit to retrace the ‘windings of my way through many years’ and to associate the retrospective landscape with the desolate scenery stretching before his eyes:

the rugged path,
And prospect oft so dreary and forlorn,
Mov’d many a sigh at its disheart’ning length. (6: 20–1)

This internalisation of dreary scenery is introduced into the genre of elegy by Thomas Gray in ‘Elegy Written in a Country Churchyard’ (1750). Strictly speaking, the poem is not a ‘pastoral elegy’. It is an elegy in the sense that the green pasture is replaced by a meditation upon human life and death in the gloomy churchyard. Nor is the season distinctively winter. It can probably be seen as a Western parallel to Japanese medieval poems on autumnal scenery; it is significant in revealing the process through which the Western literary tradition is given a new shape and meaning by a new sensibility. Just like any other graveyard poems in the eighteenth century, the ‘Elegy’ expresses a mood of
melancholy evoked at the dismal churchyard. The rural darkening landscape gradually fades into a solitary meditation on vain glories of earthly life in contrast to the tranquillity of after-life and consequently it becomes difficult to distinguish whether the poet’s descriptions are real or visionary. And the poem is dedicated not only to the dead villagers lying beneath the ground, but also to a melancholic poet, perhaps Gray’s double, whose epitaph commemorates his virtue and piety.

We find a Romantic version of this inner desolation in P. B. Shelley’s *Adonais* (1821), a pastoral elegy for John Keats. The poem is modelled on the elegies of both Bion and Moschus in terms of structure, but the clichéd image of wintry landscape is being reinvented by his acute, almost narcissistic self-consciousness into a metaphor for the death of his own poetical imagination. Shelley saw the crisis of his own poetic self in the death of Keats, whom he believed to be killed by malicious reviewers. A lamentation of his deceased colleague moves easily into pity over his own alienated, misunderstood and unappreciated situation. From the beginning of the poem, the personified Death dominates the scene, invoking the inner darkness and desertion created by the decease of the poetic genius: ‘I weep for Adonais—he is dead!’ (1). The image of flowers standing ‘wan’ and ‘sere’ (141) indicates the wilderness of his own inner mind. The death of Adonais implies a decease of Shelley’s own creative imagination: ‘Splendour’ and ‘breath’, which are the Shelleyean symbols for imagination, evaporate from Adonais’s lips, leaving the whole world in darkness (101, 104):

The damp death
Quenched its caress upon his icy lips;
And, as a dying meteor stains a wreath
Of moonlight vapour, which the cold night clips,
It flushed through his pale limbs, and past to its eclipse. (104–08)

Even the immortalisation of his soul into a heavenly star does not relieve Shelley’s mind from the constant anxiety about his own turbulent, unforeseeable future. Unlike Basho’s ‘withered moor’, Shelley’s inner desolation does not lead to the ‘enlightened’ Zen world of ‘Nothingness’: on the contrary, it suggests an unredeemable state of dejection. The image is a kind of ‘pathetic fallacy’; his excessive emotions have caused a ‘dissociation of sensibility’, a separation of pathos and thought which modern critics often find in Romantic and Victorian poems. The internalised image of barrenness dominates elegies in the nineteenth century, such as Tennyson’s *In Memoriam* and Arnold’s *Thyrsis*.

The Withered Moor in the Twentieth Century

In the twentieth century, literature in general tends to be anti-elegiac, anti-Romantic,
and anti-conventional, but we can still find enduring continuities in the genre of pastoral elegy. A good example of the modern version of wintry landscape is presented in W. H. Auden’s elegy for W. B. Yeats. At the outset of the poem, Auden describes the real wintry landscape stretching before his eyes. Winter, in this case, literally becomes a season of death, and the decease of the senior poet adds a grievous tone to the dismal landscape of the ‘dark cold day’.

He disappeared in the dead of winter:
The brooks were frozen, the air-ports almost deserted,
And snow disfigured the public statues;
The mercury sank in the mouth of the dying day.
O all the instruments agree
The day of his death was a dark cold day. (1–6)

The word ‘dead’ in the first line resonates heavily and ominously throughout the poem. It evokes not only the frozen, bleak climate of mid-winter, but also the dark, sinister shadow of death covering up the whole earth. This wintry landscape can hardly be regarded as ‘pathetic fallacy’; it functions as what T. S. Eliot calls an ‘objective correlative’, an appropriate object which metaphorically communicates inner feelings in a way that the reader will re-experience them through the reading of the text. To modern readers, deserted airports and a sinking thermometer far more palpably convey the feelings of sorrow and distress on the ‘dark, cold day’ than weeping rivers or nymphs would do.

The mournful harmony of nature and pathos is further intensified by Auden’s metaphorical identification of desolation with Yeats’s corpse, in which the streams of blood stop running and imagination is forever frozen:

The squares of his mind were empty,
Silence invaded the suburbs,
The current of his feeling failed: he became his admirers. (15–7)

The passage leads to the theme of the last section of the poem, which deals with the posthumous life of Yeats’s poetry. Just as elegists conventionally did, Auden extols the dead poet as the guardian spirit, but he is well aware of the limited influence of poetry in the modern age; it ‘makes nothing happen’ (36). Poetry ‘flows south / From ranches of isolation and the busy griefs’ (39) and survives only in the mouth and mind of his admirers, who suffer from ‘human unsuccess / In a rapture of distress’:

In the deserts of the heart
Let the healing fountain start,
In the prison of his days
Teach the free man how to praise. (74 – 7)

By ‘the deserts of the heart’, Auden implies that a green pasture exists no more in the modern society. The resurrection of the dead poetic soul is attained, but not as a heavenly star, but in the inner deserts of people’s hearts which are afflicted by success and ‘unsuccess’, by vision and disappointment in the ever-changing worldly life.

The elegy is in part designed to supply an answer to Yeats’s obstinate questioning about the posthumous fate of his work. Yeats’s Last Poems contains a series of self-elegies which repeatedly place this obsession in desolate scenery. In ‘Under Ben Bulben’, for example, Yeats envisages himself dead at the foot of the wintry Irish hill, and continues to examine the value of his work in ‘Man and the Echo’. Auden attempted to console such an anxious soul of Yeats by providing an eternal resting place in the hearts of his admirers. The wintry landscape is modernised into an emblem of the bleak, forlorn hearts of people, who are longing for the healing spring of verses.

Auden’s solid image of wintry scene would not have been created if it were not for the Symbolist and Imagist movements in the early twentieth century. Imagism was formulated in part after the model of the haiku form. In haiku, poets have to condense all their emotions or thoughts in the tiny space of seventeen syllables through an almost illogical juxtaposition of images. The shortness and simplicity also suit well the Zen mentality which radically strikes the truth in a brief phrase, short-cutting all tedious arguments. Hence the importance of images. This is a feature of haiku that appealed most to Western poets, notably Ezra Pound, who sought to recreate the history of Western literature by installing at its centre, ‘the Image’ made of ‘a vortex or cluster of fused ideas’ and charged with emotional ‘energy’. The withered moor in Buson’s haiku is a good example in which a great truth of human life is arrested in the dynamic and daring contrast between a shitting abbot and the moor landscape:

On the withered moor
Is shitting
A virtuous abbot.

The authority of the holy spiritual figure is here humorously revealed as a mere creature shitting in the great nature. The withered moor symbolises the world of natural instincts, where no institutionalised powers are admitted.

This dynamism is inherent in renga or linked poems, from which the initial form of haiku emerged. This conventionalised dynamic image of the desolate field lies behind the withered moor in Basho’s death poem. In the movement of haiku revival in early twentieth-century Japan, the wintry moor was again taken up by modern poets, but the
image was re-charged with far more complicated meanings and implications. Shiki was most attracted to the image of the withered moor. While promoting descriptive haiku, he obstinately defended the convention of kigo. For Shiki, convention and innovation are not contradictory: there always is a possibility of the innovation, and the ‘fossilisation’, of kigo. Admitting that the restricted use of each term for one particular season constrains the composition of haiku, he argues that the continuous reconstructions of one seasonal phrase in various contexts will consequently append complex resonance and profound implications. In spite of his seeming conservatism, Shiki’s withered moor expresses a modern spirit and sensibility.

On a wintry field  
Stands forlorn  
The gate of a ruined monastery.

Though simply descriptive at a glance, the poem represents a new historical context in Japan, which loses her traditional religion and values in the midst of rapidly Westernising Japanese society. The temple has now fallen as a complete ruin on the wintry moor; it reminds us of Shakespeare’s Sonnet 73, which laments the dissolution of the medieval Christian tradition with the image of ‘yellow leaves, or none, or few’ shaking against ‘the cold, / Bare ruined choirs’ of an abbey (2–4). Shiki’s ruined monastery similarly stands on the moor as if it were a symbol of the decline of Buddhism and the Zen spirit; like Shakespeare, Shiki saw the destructive power of Time operating on this mutable world. Nostalgia for the past is mingled with the acceptance of the mutability of all that existed on earth. The withered moor thus becomes a state of our spiritual vacancy in the modern age. Behind the above image of the wintry moor, we can also recollect all the changing pictures and landscapes of the withered moor in the literature of the past. Not only the moors of Buson and Basho, but also that of Hitomaro are stretching over the field beyond the ruined gate. The accumulated convention deepens and magnifies the profound implications behind the single image of wintry landscape.

Conclusion: What Lies beyond Convention?

The incessant recreations of the image of wintry desolation is a universal literary undertaking both in the West and in Japan. They are rooted in our natural instinctive desire to re-confirm and re-establish our human nature through the analogy between natural seasons and human pathos. The seasonal image is established as a literary convention both in pastoral elegy and in Japanese poetry, but it does not necessarily lead to a rigid and permanent delimitation of its meanings and implications. A convention in literature is not like a replica of antiques. It is a living tradition, that is, an organic body
which grows perpetually and unlimitedly, changing its shape, feature and even substance according to the spirit of the age and to the social and historical context.

T. S. Eliot once suggested that ‘tradition’ is decomposed and reconstructed whenever ‘an individual talent’ brings a new element and a new spirit into the fold of established canons. The convention of the wintry landscape of desolation is such a tradition which has been constantly refashioned and recreated by ‘individual talents’. Certainly it has been invariably a locale of death and mourning in Western pastoral elegy, but Spenser introduced its generic confluence with a lover’s complaint, whilst Auden sought for a consolation for the inner deserts of the modern hearts. The withered moor in Japanese poetry likewise evokes the sense of loss and the pathos of melancholy, but each era recreated its image with a new aesthetic consciousness.

Wintry landscape of desolation is universally elegiac, but it is not readily translatable in different languages and cultures. Nature alters her seasonal appearances in different countries and geographies, and such climatic diversity cultivates different seasonal perceptions. It is difficult for Japanese people to imagine what the true Western pastoral should be like, with few sheep and little pasture in their countryside. Nor is it easy for a Western man to understand why a vast blank space of the wild moor can be perceived as a symbol of meaningful human life.

Elegies in the twentieth century are, in general, more self-conscious, more ironic, and thus more unconsolatory with their styles getting further complicated and variegated. The conventional framework of pastoral elegies is similarly neither a permanently fixed rule nor a cumbersome restraint upon poetic imagination; because of its own living tradition, it can recreate itself into an image with profound meanings and complicated resonances on the basis of manifold personal feelings and individual contexts even in this vastly computerised, globalising society. The history of the image of wintry desolation in pastoral elegies has exemplified the endless innovations of kigo in Western literature by individual talents throughout the ages.

Notes

1. The original form of this essay was presented as “In the desert of the heart”: A Cultural Comparison of Seasonal Feelings in Pastoral Elegy and Haiku’ for The World Haiku Festival, held at Daiwa House, London, in August 2000.


17. All my English translations of Japanese poems in this essay, including this piece, are made primarily for the purpose of clarifying religious and philosophical implications behind each text and rhetoric.


19. Makoto Ueda associates the communion between the subject and the objective in Basho’s poems with Baudelaire’s idea of ‘correspondence’, but I think that the correspondence between pathos and seasonal cycles in pastoral elegy is a more appropriate subject for a comparison. See *Zeami, Bashô, Yeats: A Study in Japanese and English Poetics* (London: Mouton, 1965) 40.


26. F. W. Weitzmann points out that Spenser was the first poet that applied the word ‘elegy’ to ‘a chant of personal grief’, ‘Notes on the Elizabethan Elegies’, *PMLA* 50 (1935): 439–40.


28. The word ‘elegy’ was employed by Elizabethans to indicate various kinds of poems, such as general lament, an epistolary poem, a plaintive love lyric, and even an epitaph. For this generic confluence of Elizabethan elegies, see Weizmann, ‘Elizabethan Elegies’, 433–43. As for the modernity and irony in *The Shepherdes Calender*, see Sacks, *English Elegy*, 41–2.

29. For a good analysis of structural patters of the poem, see A. C. Hamilton, ‘The Argument of Spenser’s *The Shepherdes Calender*’, *English Literary History*, 23 (1956): 171–82. We cannot deny that the carefully submerged historical allusions lie behind the allegory of the poem, but I would like to focus on the image of the November landscape within the literary tradition of pastoral elegy.

30. There is a significant contrast between Theocritus’s first *Idyll*, which begins with the word ‘Sweet’, and Spenser’s elegy, which is placed in winter from the very beginning.

32. On this point, see Rosenmeyer, *Green Cabinet*, 12.
39. We may well be reminded here of John Keats’s ‘To Autumn’, in which the fading autumnal landscape suddenly provokes the poet’s nostalgic lamentation, ‘Where are the songs of spring?’ (23), but immediately his yearning heart subsides into a calm, selfless acceptance of the approach of the cold, desolate season of death. This open-hearted passivity in the poem represents the aesthetic aptitude which Keats himself calls ‘Negative Capability’. With Wordsworth’s ‘wise passiveness’, such an attitude appears to be the closest of all Western mental attitudes to the Japanese poetic sensibility to nature.
45. Quotations from Shelley’s *Adonais* is from *Shelley’s Poetry and Prose: Authoritative Texts and Criticism*, eds. Donald H. Reiman and Sharon B. Powers (New York: W. W. Norton, 1977). I do not agree with Sacks, who views *Adonais* as anomalous among Romantic pastoral poems; its internalised landscape of desolation is typical of Romantic dejection, as we can see in Coleridge’s ‘Dejection: an Ode’, or in Wordsworth’s *The Excursion*, Book 3, which describes the despondency of the Solitary, or in the faded image of paradise in Keats’s various poems, notably in ‘To Autumn’ and ‘The Fall of Hyperion’.
47. For a detailed and extremely valuable examination of modern elegies, if not pastoral elegies, in the context of literary traditions, see Jahan Ramazani, *Poetry of Mourning: The Modern Elegy from Hardy to Heaney* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).
48. The poem is unconventional as a pastoral elegy because it omits a description of the happy pastoral scenery, but Auden is clearly aware of the tradition of the *genre* and its conventions and deliberately places Yeats’s corpse in wintry desolation, despite the fact that he had died in south France. Elegy was the *genre* that most attracted Auden’s mind.

50. For an interesting argument on Auden’s preoccupation with Yeats’s elegiac poems, see Ramazani, *The Poetry of Mourning*, 182–194.


52. We can compare this poem with the following piece composed by Albert Saijo, a friend of Jack Kerouac’s, which, I think, characterises the way in which haiku was received by the Beat Generation.

Eating nectar from
the flowers, bees
shit honey.

The piece appears similar to Buson’s *haiku*, but only on the superficial level: it entirely lacks the dynamic Zen spirit. Jack Kerouac, Albert Saijo, Lew Welch, *Trip Trap: Haiku along the Road from San Francisco* (Bolinas: Grey Fox Press, 1973) 29.

53. The following two poems illustrate how the image of the withered moor was originally instituted in *renge* with wit and humour.

Startled by the songs of insects
In the withered field,
I prayed for the after-life

I looked around, only to find the withered moor
Stretching far and wild beyond the *Sen-nichi* temple;
No echoes of the bell in the winds blowing thro’ the pine-trees.\(^5\)

The first poem took over the autumnal songs of insects in a preceding poem and located them in the withered field. The next poet by Shoyu, in turn, hears the blowing wind over the withered field. He tactfully reminds us of Teika’s evening song at the beginning of the poem and intensifies the dreariness of the landscape by deliberately presenting the desolate picture of a temple in the wind, instead of the images of flowers and maple trees. He thus incorporates the Buddhist consciousness of mutability in the vast blank space of the wintry field where the wind continues blowing through the pine-trees of a holy temple. It is an image of spirits drifting through the desolate moor, seeking for a divine resting place.

54. R. H. Blyth collects a significant number of modern poems which contain the image of the withered, wintry moor in *Haiku: Volume IV Autumn–Winter* (Tokyo: Hokusaido, 1952) 278–94. I am indebted to him for the translations of Shiki’s poem which follows as well as Buson’s poem mentioned above.


With his acute historical consciousness, Eliot himself re-evaluated and re-created the whole history of English literature in his own poetical work, discarding what he saw as derangement in Romantic literature and, instead, restoring Metaphysical poetry as a central model.