Appropriating the Other on the Edge of the World:
Representations of the Western Middle Ages in Modern Japanese Culture

Atsushi Iguchi

'It was not my strength that needed nursing, it was my imagination that wanted soothing.'

— Joseph Conrad, *Heart of Darkness*

世界の端っこで他者を我有化する

―現代日本文化における西洋中世の表象―

井　口　　　篤 [1]

ABSTRACT

This article explores how the Western Middle Ages is represented in contemporary Japanese popular culture. I will begin by describing the persistent recurrence in today's world of images that originated in the Middle Ages. This cultural phenomenon, generally called 'medievalism', has been a site where various forms of nationalist, religious and academic ideologies vie with each other to lay claim to the idea of Europe. Even though the European Middle Ages has little to do with Japan—owing to the latter's geopolitical remoteness from the former—images of the Middle Ages have nonetheless been frequently exploited in post-war Japanese popular culture. An examination of *Vinland Saga* by Makoto Yukimura, a serialized manga set in eleventh-century northern Europe reveals that the appropriation of the Middle Ages by Japanese popular culture is far from escapist. Indeed, on closer inspection, it will turn out that the 'otherness' of European medieval culture to the Japanese does not prevent Yukimura from skilfully conveying the important themes of exile and homecoming, themes which are of paramount importance in medieval Europe, where the life of a human being was regarded as a homecoming to God. In an apparently faithful attempt to provide an escapist, entertaining replication of medieval European society, Yukimura allows the reader to have a glimpse of a world teeming with violence, crises of faith, and ruthless exploitation.

要　旨

　本稿は、西洋中世が現代日本の大衆文化においてどのように表象されているかについて考察する。はじめに、西洋中世に端を発するイメージが今日の世界においても繰り返し現れることに言及する。これは一般的に「中世主義」と呼ばれる文化現象であり、この現象においては、これまでに様々な形のナショナリスト的、宗教的、そして学問的イデオロギーが互いに争うように「ヨーロッパ」という概念を我がものとしようとしてきた。しかし日本はヨーロッパと地政学的に隔絶しており、現在の領土を正当化するために中世ヨーロッパという概念を喚起することはない。にもかかわらず、中世西洋のイメージは戦後日本の大衆文化において頻繁に利用されてきた。本稿は、11 世紀の北欧を描く幸村誠の連載漫画『ヴィンランド・サガ』を分析することにより、日本の大衆文化における中世ヨーロッパの我有化は、現実逃避的とは到底言えないことを示す。作者の幸村にとって、中世ヨーロッパの日本人にとっての他者性はまったく障害ではない。幸村は亡命と帰郷という重要なテーマを作品の中で技巧的に展開することに成功している。この亡命と帰郷というテーマは、人間の一生が神への帰郷であると捉えられていた中世ヨーロッパにおいても重要であった。幸村の作品は一見中世ヨーロッパの社会を忠実に再現しようと試みているだけに見えるが、暴力、信仰の危機、仮借なき搾取に溢れる社会を読者に提供している。

[1] 放送大学准教授（「人間と文化」コース）

I . Spectres of Medievalism

We have not been good friends with the European Middle Ages. Numerous thinkers, historizns, writers, artists, and politicians have used and exploited the Middle Ages repeatedly during the past centuries, especially since the nineteenth century. The Middle Ages has indeed been a site where a variety of political, cultural and ideological standpoints with different needs and aspirations converge.[1] To realize the persistence of this cultural phenomenon in modern times, generally referred to as 'medievalism'—defined by Alice Chandler as 'a response to historic change and to the problems raised by the various revolutions and transformations of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries'[2]—we need not look further than Richard Wagner's rendition of medieval legends, Walter Scott's adventurous historical novels, and the pre–Raphaelites' idealized portraits of medieval literary figures. All of these, though often turning out to be historically inaccurate upon rigorous scrutiny, have been enormously influential in shaping our images about this phase in European history.

Wagner can be excused from crude, careless misrepresentation of the Middle Ages because he is an artist and therefore has a right to creative licence. However, scholars have been no less culpable in this respect. Nineteenth–century historiography and philology testify abundantly to instances of scholarship tainted by nationalist ideology.[3] Even twentieth–century medievalists, wittingly or unwittingly, invented their own versions of the Middle Ages, depending on their specific political, religious and cultural backgrounds.[4] Moreover, Bruce Holsinger has cogently demonstrated that a group of poststructuralist thinkers, commonly referred to as 'French avant–garde', such as Georges Bataille, Jacques Lacan, and Jacques Derrida, were themselves closely involved with medieval studies at some point in their philosophical careers. These philosophers developed their thought by engaging in various ways with medieval texts. This suggests that medieval studies and medievalism were deeply implicated in so–called postmodernism or poststructuralism.[5]

The Europeans have thus repeatedly turned to the idea of the Middle Ages in order to lay claim to both its continuity and discontinuity from them: while renouncing this period as barbarous, backward and reactionary, they have frequently sought the origins of Europe and the individual nation–states in the embryonic medieval kingdoms, thus asserting the legitimacy of governance and control of their present territorial domain. In 1950, an award called the 'Charlemagne Prize' was created in Europe to celebrate people, works of art, or institutions that greatly contributed to the reinforcement of European identity and unification. The Emperor Charlemagne, who no doubt successfully created a kingdom that flourished politically, economically, and culturally, probably did not dream of such a common identity as European–ness, and might be turning in his grave to know that an award bearing his name was granted in 2002 to the 'Euro'.[6]

It is not only for the sake of national identity that the Middle Ages were appropriated: religion was also one of the prominent sites in which the scholarly results of medieval studies were both advanced and put to use. Studies of medieval mystics, as Nicholas Watson has shown, were conducted 'under the auspices of the ecclesiastical, not secular, academy'.[7] Consequently, medieval mystics were 'used' to serve the religious agenda of the nineteenth– and twentieth–century Catholic Church, which strove to defend the authenticity of religious experience in an era in which religious faith was perceived to be increasingly in decline.[8]

In such a situation, where Europeans are vying to appropriate the Middle Ages for the sake of justifying themselves, it is not surprising that the representations of the Middle Ages are more often than not ideologically deflected to the extent that the 'real' Middle Ages are no longer recognizable. It is good to remember, however, that 'the Middle Ages' usually designates a period that spans about as long as one thousand years, conventionally from the fall of the Roman Empire (476) to the fall of the Byzantine Empire (1453). The earlier half of this period, normally until about 1000, has so far had the misfortune to be called 'the Dark Ages', and it is particularly this era that lasted more than five hundred years, which has indelibly imprinted in our minds the negative images that the term 'Middle Ages' evokes. Indeed, in modern English 'medieval' is almost synonymous with 'barbarian', 'brutal', 'irrational', 'superstitious' and other words with distinctly negative connotations.[9] A case in point is Quentin Tarrantino's 1994 film *Pulp Fiction*, in which one character says 'I'm gonna git medieval on your ass', evoking dark, sinister and abnormal deeds that the audience is somehow expected to understand.[10] In popular culture, a wide array of figures, incidents, and customs taken from the whole of the Middle Ages are frequently amalgamated to form a mishmash of images that recur in computer games, Sci–Fi, and pseudo–historical novels, a phenomenon that contributes greatly to our repertoire of images and ideas concerning the Middle Ages.[11]

Of course, there has been no shortage of critics who are acutely aware of this, and scholars working on the early Middle Ages have time and again urged us to see this allegedly 'dark' chronological chunk without prejudice. It is now well known that the denigration of the Middle Ages was vitalized and highly institutionalized in a post–Enlightenment age, and that the theocentric Middle Ages has been conceptualized in contradistinction to the humanist and rational Renaissance, the former made to look diametrically opposed to the latter.[12] The historian Chris Wickham quips that '[e]arly medieval Europe has, over and over, been misunderstood'.[13] According to him, 'Europe was not born in the early Middle Ages. No common identity in 1000 linked Spain to Russia, Ireland to the Byzantine empire […] except the very weak sense of community that linked Christian polities together'. The same can be said about the identity of each European country: '[n]ational identities, too, were not widely prominent in 1000, even if one rejects the association between nationalism and modernity made in much contemporary scholarship'.[14] It is often a misleading and ideologically–driven enterprise, therefore, to try to establish a link between a contemporary European nation–state and its supposed medieval counterpart. As is often pointed out, Romantic ideology, inextricably bound up with nineteenth–century nationalism, galvanized the contemporary historians and writers into bolstering and concocting their national identity by claiming the continuity with the past, and twentieth– and twenty–first–century scholars have by no means been free from this ideology.[15] The medievalist Patrick J. Geary warns us against this time–honoured historiographical practice, calling the site of this ideological forging of origins 'a toxic waste dump'.[16] Geary's persistent concern is hardly surprising considering that even now books entitled *The Birth of Europe* and *The Making of Europe* are being published, both of which, though admirably accessible and intelligent books, confidently trace the origins of present–day Europe to the Middle Ages.[17]

Ⅱ. The Western Middle Ages as Japan's Other

With so many historians cautious about how to represent and engage the Western Middle Ages, it is tempting to explore how the Middle Ages is represented in areas or countries that are geographically remote from Europe. American medievalists, for example, have been acutely aware of the cultural distance of the Western Middle Ages: Gabrielle M. Spiegel claims that for American scholars, 'the Middle Ages constituted "an absent other"', suggesting that America is doubly removed from the European Middle Ages, which evokes not only alterity but also absence.[18] It seems, however, that this 'absent otherness' holds true for Japan rather than for America, since Americans—especially those of European descent—might perhaps be able to claim a connection and continuity with the European past due to America's distant yet dimly perceptible European origin, while Japanese scholars can by no means aspire to such a genealogy.

However, as Kathleen Biddick says, '[a]s both non-origin and origin, the Middle Ages can be everywhere, both medieval and postmodern, and nowhere, sublime and redemptive'.[19] Regardless of continuity, the Western Middle Ages is employed everywhere in the world, in its myriad disguises and transformations brought about by cultural specificity and diversity. The ubiquity of the Middle Ages is well attested by Japanese post–war popular culture, which has been inundated with images of the Western Middle Ages. Any casual browser of the bookshelves in Japan's book shops will never fail to notice that they are full of images of the European Middle Ages: one has only to recall popular manga such as *Berserk* and *Vinland Saga*, historical novels including *The Legend of the Holy Ash*（『聖灰の伝説』）, or a wide range of role–playing computer games such as *Dragon Quest* and *Final Fantasy*.

The fact that Japanese popular culture thus abounds in images of the Western Middle Ages reminds us of how 'intimately alien' they are to us; the Middle Ages are, paradoxically, both far from *and* close to us.[20] But this poses a conundrum: if we do not have anything to lay claim to, then what are we doing here? Even if understanding the past correctly is demanded of Europeans, the heirs to the cultural heritage, one might wonder if our geopolitical distance from Europe can exempt us from 'properly' representing the European Middle Ages. Do we not think that we are allowed simply to take delight in imagining ourselves living in a distant land? Are we not, after all, conceiving the Western Middle Ages merely as the Other and thus incommensurable? And do we not believe that this alterity of the Middle Ages somehow exonerates us from presenting them in whatever crude ways we like? Is it merely a harmless, escapist pastime that we are engaged in, or are we presenting another case of 'that creepy infantilism that percolates through much of Japanese popular culture'?[21] These are all difficult questions to answer, but the situation becomes more complex precisely because some representations of the Middle Ages in Japanese popular culture attempt rather faithfully to reproduce the

Middle Ages, with no apparent ulterior motive other than to entertain the reader. Close examination of these cultural products will, however, lay bare the latent strategies of cultural appropriation that is necessitated by Japan's specific politico–cultural situations.

This fidelity to sources is indeed quite beguiling. It obscures what is operative behind the seemingly faithful reproductions of medieval textual and visual artefacts. In this article, I explore how the Western Middle Ages are represented in Japanese popular culture and what kind of aims they serve by analysing the blockbuster manga *Vinland Saga* (『ヴィンランド・サガ』) by Makoto Yukimura (幸村誠).

Yukimura surveys thoroughly and conscientiously the time and place that he has chosen for his work—that is, eleventh–century northern Europe—and commits his research to pages without distorting historical facts. Yukimura, however, presents the reader with his own tantalizing version of the European Middle Ages, when the Vikings were engaged in endless fighting and pillaging both barbarously and heroically. In discussing the philosophical and political aspects of medievalism, Alice Chandler argues that '[m]edievalism forced man to imagine a totally different society instead of merely acquiescing in his own'.[22] What kind of society, then, does Yukimura envision in *Vinland Saga*?

Ⅲ．Homecoming in *Vinland Saga*

A brief summary of *Vinland Saga* is in order. *Vinland Saga* started its serialization in the comic magazine *Afternoon* in 2005. The story starts *in medias res*: we witness a battle fought between two Frankish tribes on the continent, and a band of Viking warriors offer to support one of them in exchange for loot. Among these warriors is a young warrior, Thorfinn, who, despite his adolescence, is already no less adept in sword and agile in movement than the other soldiers in the troop. Thorfinn is presented as something of a maverick among the Vikings because he appears to have a complicated mental relationship with the leader, Askelad, whom he challenges for a duel after the battle, but by whom he is beaten miserably. Indeed, this Askelad had killed Thorfinn's father, Thors, ten years before, and Thorfinn has been desperately attempting to avenge his father even though he is now under Askelad's command. Sulking and depressed, alone in a bark, Thorfinn conjures in his mind his long–dead father, an apparition which has him recollect his childhood.

Thorfinn grows up in eleventh–century Iceland, where he lives with his family（father, mother, and el-

der sister）peacefully and contentedly. But one day Thorfinn's sister finds a slave buried under the snow, who has just barely escaped from his master, helplessly wandering in the snowstorm with nowhere to go. The owner of the slave soon comes to reclaim him with his band of followers. Thors somehow insists that he purchase the dying slave in exchange for eight lambs, a costly agreement that puzzles those around him. Thors tries to console the dying slave by proposing that they all go and live in a land called 'Vinland', a name given by the medieval Norsemen to North America.[23] This yearning for a paradisiacal, mythical Xanadu and longing for a better life in another place powerfully inform *Vinland Saga*. Indeed, one of the recurring themes of Yukimura's thrilling presentation of Thorfinn's half–life is his and other characters' hankering after something that does not belong to them, which arguably characterizes the collective psyche of the post–war Japanese.

Now the story quickens its pace: a band of warriors appears at the coast of Thorfinn's village. Thorfinn's father, Thors, was once a member of the invincible Jomsvikings, a legendary army of ruthless mercenaries. Having fled the army after Thorfinn was born, Thors lived a contented life with his family in Iceland with no connection whatsoever with warfare and pillage. But escaping from the Jomsvikings is a capital sin that violates their sacrosanct mores. Thors finds himself obliged to strike a pact with the Jomvikings. In order to safeguard his family's and the villagers' peaceful life, he now must join the Vikings for a war that has just begun in Britain between the Anglo–Saxons and the Danes. Thus, *Vinland Saga* is again firmly anchored in the contemporary European political landscape.

The main characters of *Vinland Saga* aspire to and dream of somewhere that is not here, a place that is practically unreachable（and therefore all the more attractive）. But the overtone of *Vinland Saga* is by no means nostalgic or escapist, for it does not present medieval Europe in a pre–lapsarian tone: the lives of people inhabiting it are described as caught in political, social, and emotional complications that are not easily disentangled. Thorfinn, for instance, cannot think of anything else than avenging his father Thors, who was killed by Askelad, and grows up to be a bitter, cynical adolescent who has forgotten how to smile. When Askelad is killed in a commotion that takes place at King Sven's court, however, Thorfinn finds himself having irrevocably lost what has always impelled him; he realizes that he will never be able to avenge his father and is utterly lethargic and apathetic. For now, the hope of finding his own homeland—

avenging his father, thereby returning happily to Iceland, and perhaps even finding the mythical Vinland ―has altogether vanished in an instant.

As the target of revenge, Askelad had of course been much hated and resented by Thorfinn. Askelad, however, was also a father figure to Thorfinn, who challenged him countless times（and was always beaten）, another reason for Thorfinn's profound emotional crisis. Being of Welsh extraction, and having the legendary British King Arthur as his ancestor―or so he claims and believes―Askelad is also someone who dreams of returning to his homeland, Wales. It is perhaps because Thorfinn unwittingly recognizes within Askelad a desire for a better place than here, which is not dissimilar to Thorfinn's father's, that Askelad's death shocked Thorfinn so much. Thors had ingrained in Thorfinn the yearning for the paradisiacal Vinland, Thorfinn's imaginary homeland that corresponds to Askelad's Wales or the return of Arthur, and Thorfinn's dogged attempts to kill Askelad are his own way to achieve his homecoming. In the latest issue of *Vinland Saga*, we see Thorfinn tilling land as a slave in Denmark―Cnut had sold him to a wealthy landowner in Juteland. The reader has yet to find what kind of homeland he eventually finds.

Another main character of *Vinland Saga*, Cnut, the legendary Danish King who ultimately（though briefly）achieved the unification of England, Denmark, and Norway, is presented at the beginning of the manga as an effeminate, devout, and kind young man. After Askelad's troop abducts him for strategic purposes（the episode is of course an embellishment by Yukimura）, Cnut decides that his Christian God is absolutely no use to him. The slaughter of his attendant Ragnar by the Vikings, on whom Cnut has always relied since childhood, and the ensuing bloody battle fought between two Viking bands right in front of him, irremediably scarred him. This incident was cruel enough to make Cnut cast doubt on whether God ever manifests himself on earth.

After this carnage, Cnut resolutely sets out to claim the crown of the Kingdom of Denmark. Once thought of as a coward by his father King, he is now determined to topple his father and create a paradisiacal kingdom here on earth by conquering England and Denmark, all for the sake of mocking and challenging God―who, despite his incessant piety, has mercilessly betrayed him. In medieval Christian theology, the life of a human being is likened to a pilgrimage, or indeed a homecoming, to God.[24] Deprived of his homeland, Cnut now has to find an alternative. His enterprise is, in a way, to create an earthly homeland as opposed to the celestial, and to establish himself as the lord of that homeland. As history attests, however, his quest for homeland is destined to fail―indeed, his Scandinavian empire lasted less than a decade. Cnut's search for a homeland, then, will turn out to be fraught with as many difficulties and obstacles as Thorfinn's and Askelad's.

Ⅳ. Conclusion: In Search of a Homecoming That Never Comes

For the last couple of decades it has often been pointed out that we are now living in an age that might be termed 'the New Middle Ages'.[25] Indeed, the present world and the Western Middle Ages seem to share a number of characteristics, if one is willing to catalogue them.[26] After such an enumeration, the world in which we live now suddenly starts to look quite 'medieval'.[27] But this comparison is quite useless unless we realize that the apparent similarity of the present world to the Western Middle Ages brings home to us an urgent call for a better society. Alice Chandler reminds us that behind the rise of medievalism in increasingly industrialized England in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries lies 'a sense of the loss of connection within society itself',[28] a sense which drove numerous contemporaries to seek alternative ways of life. It is not difficult to see that this vision for reformation largely holds true, in however diluted a way it might be, for *Vinland Saga*. This sense of loss of connection leads to nostalgia. Medievalism is essentially an attempt at homecoming, or 'man' s need to believe that he belonged'.[29] But if, as Jeffrey Jerome Cohen suggests, 'the Middle Ages in their mediacy are a temporal rather than a geographic borderlands, especially in their intimate alterity to the modern, the postmodern, the postcolonial', then the project of appropriating and belonging to it is doomed to failure, still more so in contemporary Japan, which is twice removed from the Western Middle Ages in terms of geography and temporality.[30] Yukimura is well aware of this double impossibility. At first sight, Yukimura enacts a desire for homecoming and belonging by setting the idea of Vinland at the core of his story. But on closer inspection, his Vinland turns out to exist nowhere: the characters are tossed around in their endless odysseys of ruthless violence, search for identity, the will to power, and the questioning of faith. In a gesture that apparently replicates the medievalism of eighteenth–and nineteenth–century Europe Yukimura's *Vinland Saga* emerges as a portrait of a rather dark, sinister world dominated by fear and anxiety, in which heroes, warriors, politicians, merchants, sailors, and farmers are incessantly engaged in their search

for home, an ever–yearned–for utopia of which they can never lay ahold. Thus, there is much more to *Vinland Saga* than mere escapism: it presents us with a version of medieval life that powerfully resonates with those who desperately struggle to find their homelands in twenty–first–century 'medieval' Japan. How we yearn for more.

References

1　For a succinct and lucid overview of the genealogy of medievalism, especially in England, see the classic study by Alice Chandler, *A Dream of Order: The Medieval Ideal in Nineteenth–Century English Literature* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1971).

2　Ibid. p. 7.

3　Robert M. Stein, 'Multilingualism', in *Middle English*, ed. by Paul Strohm (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), pp. 23–37 [at pp. 35–6].

4　For what might be called 'academic medievalism', see Norman Cantor, *Inventing the Middle Ages: The Lives, Works, and Ideas of the Great Medievalists of the Twentieth Century* (New York: William Morrow, 1991); and R. Howard Bloch and Stephen G. Nichols, eds, *Medievalism and the Modernist Temper* (Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996).

5　Bruce Holsinger, *The Premodern Condition: Medievalism and the Making of Theory* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2005).

6　For modern representations of Charlemagne, see the magisterial study by Rosamond McKitterick, *Charlemagne: The Formation of a European Identity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), especially pp. 1–7.

7　See Nicholas Watson, 'The Middle English Mystics', in *The Cambridge History of Medieval English Literature*, ed. by David Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), pp. 539–65 [at p. 540].

8　Ibid. pp. 540–4; see also Chandler, pp. 9–10.

9　See OED, s.v. *medieval*.

10　For analyses of this oft–mentioned film from the perspective of medievalism, see Carolyn Dinshaw, *Getting Medieval: Sexualities and Communities, Pre- and Postmodern* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1999), pp. 183–206; and Marcus Bull, *Thinking Medieval: An Introduction to the Study of the Middle Ages* (London and New York: Palgrave Macmillam, 2005), pp. 10–12.

11　For this kind of 'chronological blurring' and problems raised by popular representations of the Middle Ages, see Bull, pp. 7–41 ('chronological blurring' at p. 16).

12　David Wallace, *Chaucerian Polity: Absolutist Lineages and Associational Forms in England and Italy* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1997), pp. xiv-xv; Steven F. Kruger, 'Medieval/Postmodern: HIV/AIDS and the Temporality of Crisis', in *Queering the Middle Ages*, ed. by Glenn Burger and Steven F. Kruger, Medieval Cultures, 27 (Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press, 2001), pp. 252–83.

13　Chris Wickham, *The Inheritance of Rome: A History of Europe from 400 to 1000* (London: Penguin, 2009), p. 1. Similar caveats are voiced by many scholars specializing in the early Middle Ages. See, for example, Bryan Ward–Perkins, *The Fall of Rome and the End of Civilization* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).

14　Wickham, p. 2.

15　For a concise summary, see John H. Arnold, *What Is Medieval History?* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2008), pp. 8–22.

16　Patrick J. Geary, *The Myth of Nations: The Medieval Origins of Europe* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2002), p. 15.

17　Respectively, Jacques Le Goff, *The Birth of Europe 400–1500*, trans. by Janet Lloyd (Oxford: Blackwell, 2005) and Robert Bartlett, *The Making of Europe: Conquest, Colonization and Cultural Change 950–1350* (London: Penguin, 1993).

18　Gabrielle M. Spiegel, *The Past as Text: The Theory and Practice of Medieval Historiography* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), p. 59.

19　Kathleen Biddick, *The Shock of Medievalism* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1998), p. 84.

20　The phrase is from Jeffrey Jerome Cohen, 'Hybrids, Monsters, Borderlands: The Bodies of Gerald of Wales', in *The Postcolonial Middle Ages* (New York: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 65–104 [at p. 85].

21　Henry Hitchings, 'Making Dates', review of Shuichi Yoshida's *Villain*, *Times Literary Supplement*, August 20 & 27 (2010), p. 21.

22　Chandler, p. 8.

23　Peter Sawyer, *The Oxford Illustrated History of the Vikings* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), pp. 244–5.

24　See Gerhart B. Ladner, '*Homo Viator*: Medieval Ideas on Alianation and Order', *Speculum*, 42 (1967), 233–59.

25　The literature on the so–called 'New Middle Ages' is vast. See, for example, 田中明彦、『新しい中世 – 相互依存深まる世界システム』（東京: 日本経済新聞社、1996）; and 大窪一志、『「新しい中世」の始まりと日本』（東京: 花伝社、2008）.

26　Umberto Eco, 'The Return of the Middle Ages', in *idem, Travels in Hyperreality: Essays*, trans. by William Weaver (San Diego: Harcourt, 1986), pp. 73–85. See also Kellie Robertson, *The Laborer's Two Bodies: Labor and the "Work" of the Text in Medieval Britain, 1350–1500* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2006), pp. 190–3. Michael Hardt and Antonio Negri also have frequent recourse to the likeness of postmodernity and the Middle Ages, referring to Augustine, William Morris and the mendicant orders; see their *Empire* (Cambridge, MA, and London: Harvard University Press, 2000).

27　Bruce Holsinger proposes that we should be cautious about this parallelism, suggesting that the comparison of the present world to the Middle Ages actually blinds us to more serious problems that are prevalent

world-wide（*Neomedievalism, Neoconservatism, and the War on Terror*（Chicago：Prickly Paradigm Press, 2007））.

28 Chandler, p. 3.

29 Ibid. p. 11 *et passim*.

30 Cohen, p. 98. Elsewhere he defines the Middle Ages as a *mixta*, that which defies accommodation and inte-

gration into a totality by virtue of its hybridity：'[t]he borderlands as a place of monsters [as presented by Gerald of Wales' account of the Welsh March] is analogous to the Middle Ages as a time of *mixta*, "composites"'（ibid. p. 96）.